

INTRADPARTMENTAL CORRESPONDENCE

March 3, 2017
14.2

TO: The Honorable Board of Police Commissioners

FROM: Chief of Police

SUBJECT: OPERATIONS-CENTRAL BUREAU DIGITAL IN-CAR VIDEO SYSTEM
AUDIT (AD NO. 16-003)

RECOMMENDED ACTIONS

1. It is recommended that the Board of Police Commissioners REVIEW and APPROVE the attached Operations-Central Bureau Digital In-Car Video System Audit.
2. It is recommended that the Board of Police Commissioners REVIEW and APPROVE the attached Executive Summary thereto.

DISCUSSION

Audit Division conducted the Operations-Central Bureau Digital In-Car Video System Audit to evaluate compliance with Department policies and procedures.

If additional information regarding this audit is required, please contact Arif Alikhan, Director, Office of Constitutional Policing and Policy, at (213) 486-8730.

Respectfully,



CHARLIE BECK
Chief of Police

Attachment

LOS ANGELES POLICE DEPARTMENT
OPERATIONS-CENTRAL BUREAU
DIGITAL IN-CAR VIDEO SYSTEM AUDIT
(AD No. 16-003)



Conducted by
AUDIT DIVISION

CHARLIE BECK
Chief of Police

March 2017

TABLE OF CONTENTS

OPERATIONS-CENTRAL BUREAU DIGITAL IN-CAR VIDEO SYSTEM AUDIT

		PAGE
Executive Summary		i
Purpose		1
Background		1
Audit Scope and Methodology		1
Summary of Findings		2
Detailed Findings		2
Objective No. 1	Activation of DICVS as Required	2
Objective No. 2	Synchronization of Wireless Microphones	3
Objective No. 3	Video Completeness	4
Other Related Matters		4
Physical Inspection of Cradle Port Antennas		4
Physical Inspection of Wireless Transmitter Antennas		6
Recommendations		6
Actions Taken/Management's Response		6
Addendum – Response to the Operations-Central Bureau Digital In-Car Video System Audit		

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
OPERATIONS-CENTRAL BUREAU
DIGITAL IN-CAR VIDEO SYSTEM AUDIT
Conducted by
Audit Division
Calendar Year 2016

PURPOSE

Audit Division (AD) completed an audit of the operation of the Digital In-Car Video System (DICVS) by Areas/divisions within Operations-Central Bureau (OCB) to determine if it is in conformance with Department policy and procedures.

BACKGROUND

This is the first DICVS Audit of OCB conducted by AD. The DICVS program provides digital video and audio monitoring of interactions between officers and citizens. The DICVS is currently deployed in Operations-South Bureau, Operations-Central Bureau, and Operations-West Bureau to provide digital records of traffic stops, pedestrian stops, Code-3 responses, and the transportation of suspects.

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

This audit evaluated three objectives. Of the three objectives, the Department achieved a compliance of 95 percent or higher in each. The following table summarizes the audit results.

Summary of Audit Findings

Objective No.	Objective Description	Number Meeting Standards	Percentage Meeting Standards
1	Activation of DICVS as Required	72/75	96%
2	Synchronization of Wireless Microphones	72/72	100%
3	Video Completeness	71/72	99%

CONCLUSION

Overall, OCB's compliance rates reflected stringent adherence to DICVS protocols. Additionally, Audit Division's inspection of cradle port antennas and wireless transmitter antennas also reflected OCB's stringent adherence to equipment maintenance.

RECOMMENDATION

None.

ACTIONS TAKEN/MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE

Audit Division presented the audit report to the Director, Office of Operations, and Commanding Officer, OCB; both entities expressed general agreement with the audit. Operations-Central Bureau provided action plans via the intradepartmental correspondence, Form 15.2, attached.

OPERATIONS-CENTRAL BUREAU DIGITAL IN-CAR VIDEO SYSTEM AUDIT

Conducted by
Audit Division
Calendar Year 2016

PURPOSE

Audit Division (AD) completed an audit of the operation of the Digital In-Car Video System (DICVS) by Areas/divisions within Operations-Central Bureau (OCB) to determine if it is in conformance with Department policy and procedures.

Audit Division conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards except for an external peer review was not conducted as required.¹ Those standards require that AD plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for AD findings and conclusions based on the audit objectives. Audit Division believes that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for the findings and conclusions based on the audit objectives.

BACKGROUND

This is the first DICVS Audit of OCB conducted by AD. The DICVS program provides digital video and audio monitoring of interactions between officers and the community. The DICVS is currently deployed in Operations-South Bureau (OSB), OCB, and Operations-West Bureau to provide digital records of traffic stops, pedestrian stops, Code-3 responses, and the transportation of suspects.

AUDIT SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

Audit Division randomly selected December 15, 2015, as the audit period. As of the audit date, Central Area, Rampart Area, Hollenbeck Area, Newton Area, and Central Traffic Division had deployed the DICVS. All the vehicles equipped with DICVS at OCB except for Northeast Area were included in the population.² All related Computer-Aided Dispatch (CAD) Summary Reports within the Automated Field Data Report/Incident Tracking System on the audit date were obtained and reviewed to identify incidents which warranted activation of DICVS as required by Department policy. The Gang Enforcement Detail (GED) was also included in this audit; however, if the GED was not deployed in a specific geographic Area on December 15, 2015, the closest date after that was used. Forty-three CAD Summary Reports were selected for the indicated audit period. A total of 247 incidents were identified from the CAD Summary Reports. A statistically valid random sample of 75 incidents was then obtained for review.³ Audit Division subsequently queried DICVS for videos which corresponded to the identified CAD Summary Report incidents. In addition, AD conducted field inspection of the DICVS vehicles and the wireless transmitters at each geographic Area to determine the condition of cradle port antennas and wireless transmitters antennas.⁴

¹It is anticipated an external peer review will be scheduled for the Fall of 2017.

²Northeast Area was not included in this audit because it was in the process of moving to a new location. Information Technology Infrastructure will be installed after Northeast Area moves to their new location.

³Audit Division used a 95 percent confidence level, with a four percent error rate.

⁴The cradle ports are located on the interior door posts of both the drivers and passenger's side of the vehicle. The wireless transmitter is the portable "microphone" unit that is carried by an employee to transmit audio to the DICVS.

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

This audit evaluated three objectives. Of the three objectives, the Department achieved a compliance of 95 percent or higher in each. The following table summarizes the audit results.

Table No. 1 - Summary of Audit Findings

Objective No.	Objective Description	Number Meeting Standards	Percentage Meeting Standards
1	Activation of DICVS as Required	72/75	96%
2	Synchronization of Wireless Microphones	72/72	100%
3	Video Completeness	71/72	99%

DETAILED FINDINGS

Objective No. 1 – Activation of DICVS as Required

Criteria

Department Manual Section 3/579.13, Digital In-Car Video System (DICVS) Use and Deployment. Recording Law Enforcement Activities, states, “*Required Activation of the Digital In-Car Video System. Officers shall activate the DICVS during the initiation of the following activities:*

- *All vehicle stops;*
- *All Code 3 responses and pursuits;*
- *All suspect transports;*
- *All pedestrian stops (when practicable); and,*
- *Any other occasion when, in the officer’s judgment, it would be beneficial to do so. This may include, but is not limited to, stops and detentions, crimes in progress when recording is reasonably feasible, Mobile Field Force situations, or any situation, condition, or event presenting the potential for injury, loss of life, damage to property, or any potential risk-management issue.*

Exception: *Exigent circumstances may preclude officers from activating the DICVS. Each exception will be evaluated on a case-by-case basis.”*

Audit Procedure

Audit Division identified 75 incidents including 20 vehicle stops, 36 Code-3 responses,

12 suspect transports, and seven pedestrian stops.⁵ Audit Division reviewed Digital Video Management System – Mobile Recording System Back Office Control Center to verify if the DICVS was activated to record each incident as required by Department policy. Videos that indicated the DICVS was activated or justification for not activating the DICVS was provided on the CAD summary report met the standard for this objective.

Findings

Seventy-two (96%) of the 75 incidents met the standard for this objective. The three incidents that did not meet the standard are listed below.

- Central Area – Three CAD Summary Reports indicated officers made two traffic stops and one pedestrian stop; however, AD was unable to locate corresponding videos for any of them. No justification was documented on the CAD Summary Reports.

Objective No. 2 – Synchronization of Wireless Microphones

Criteria

Each vehicle should have one or two wireless microphones which should be synchronized to the vehicle at the start of each watch by the officers. Proper synchronization of wireless microphones will help ensure the videos to have proper audio coverage. The wireless microphones also allow officers to activate the front and back cameras remotely from outside the vehicle.⁶

Audit Procedure

Audit Division reviewed the DICVS Event Logs for the 72 videos to determine if the microphones were synchronized with each patrol vehicle.⁷

Findings

Each (100%) of the wireless microphones in the 72 videos were synchronized and, therefore, met the standard for this objective.

⁵A Code-3 response occurs when a patrol vehicle is used to respond to an emergency radio call with the activation of the vehicle's emergency equipment, i.e., lights and siren are used.

⁶Synchronization is audio activation of the DICVS and is performed by momentarily touching contacts on the wireless transmitters to contacts on the cradle port.

⁷The DICVS was not activated as required in three of the 75 incidents; therefore, only 72 videos were evaluated for this objective, see Objective No. 1.

Objective No. 3 – Video Completeness

Criteria

Department Manual Section 3/579.13, Digital In-Car Video System (DICVS) Use and Deployment. Recording Law Enforcement Activities, states, *“Deactivation of the Digital In-Car Video System. Once the DICVS is activated, the front camera shall remain activated until the entire incident or field contact has stabilized or the contact has ended. The rear camera shall remain activated until the suspect (rear passenger) has exited the vehicle.”*

Note: The Digital In-Car Video System can only be deactivated from the inside of the vehicle.”

Audit Procedure

Audit Division reviewed 72 videos for which the DICVS was activated to ensure they were complete. If the video indicated that the front camera remained activated until the entire incident or field contact stabilized, or if the contact ended and the rear camera remained activated until the suspect (rear passenger) has exited the vehicle, it met the standard for this objective.⁸

Findings

Seventy-one (99%) of the 72 videos reviewed were activated during the entire incident and met the standard for this objective. The video that did not meet the standard is listed below.

- Newton Area – During one transport, the DICVS was shut down by officers when they arrived at a police facility. Thus, the suspect was still inside the vehicle when the video ended.

OTHER RELATED MATTERS

Physical Inspection of Cradle Port Antennas

Audit Division conducted a physical inspection of the DICVS cradle port antennas. Audit Division obtained a complete list of 268 DICVS equipped vehicles from OCB’s DICVS coordinator. Of the 268 vehicles, AD inspected 143 vehicles, which were located at the geographic Areas at the time of the audit. The vehicles were examined to determine the condition of the cradle port antennas.

One-hundred forty-two of the 143 cradle port antennas were in working order.

One cradle port antenna from a Rampart Area vehicle was missing.⁹ Table No. 2 summarizes the results of the cradle port antennas.

⁸Due to the post-incident buffer recording incorporated into DICVS, when an officer deactivates the system, the DICVS records an extra minute of video without audio.

⁹Operations-Central Bureau took immediate actions generating a complaint face sheet for the missing antenna to conduct further investigation

Table No. 2 – Inspection of Cradle Port Antennas

Area	Inventory	Inspected	Antennas Meeting Standard	Percentage Meeting the Standard
Central Area	91	24	24	100%
Rampart Area	66	39	38	97%
Hollenbeck	56	44	44	100%
Newton	59	25	25	100%
Central Traffic Division	23	11	11	100%
Total	295	143	142	99%

Physical Inspection of Wireless Transmitter Antennas

A complete list of 569 DICVS wireless transmitters was obtained from OCB’s DICVS coordinator. Audit Division conducted a field inspection to determine the condition of the wireless transmitters’ antennas of 325 wireless transmitters available in the kit rooms and ready to be deployed.

Each of the 325 wireless transmitter antennas were in working order.

Table No. 3 summarizes the results of the wireless transmitter antennas.

Table No. 3 – Inspection of Wireless Transmitter Antennas

Area	Inventory	Inspected	Antennas Meeting Standard	Percentage Meeting the Standard
Central Area	173	94	94	100%
Rampart Area	125	59	59	100%
Hollenbeck	124	68	68	100%
Newton	107	73	73	100%
Central Traffic Division	40	31	31	100%
Total	569	325	325	100%

RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

ACTIONS TAKEN/MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE

Audit Division presented the audit report to the Director, Office of Operations, and Commanding Officer, OCB; both entities expressed general agreement with the audit. Operations-Central Bureau provided action plans via the intradepartmental correspondence, Form 15.2, attached.

INTRADEPARTMENTAL CORRESPONDENCE

September 29, 2016
1.4

TO: Commanding Officer, Audit Division

RECEIVED

DEC 19 2016



FROM: Commanding Officer, Operations-Central Bureau

Internal Audits & Inspections Division

SUBJECT: **OPERATIONS-CENTRAL BUREAU DIGITAL IN-CAR VIDEO SYSTEM
AUDIT - RESPONSE**

In accordance with the Los Angeles Police Department (Department) Annual Audit Plan for calendar year 2016, Audit Division (AD) completed an audit of the utilization and monitoring of the Digital In-Car Video Systems (DICVS) by Areas/divisions within Operations-Central Bureau (OCB). A response was requested from the Commanding Officer, Audit Division, pursuant to distribution.

After careful review, I generally concur with the findings of AD, as accurately depicting the utilization and monitoring protocols and conditions within OCB at the time of the AD inspections.

Since the identified inspection period, however, I have established significant additional measures within OCB, mitigating the apparent deficiencies identified by this audit. Those measures, and the identified Objective deficiencies that were implemented to mitigate, are as follows:

Objective No. 1 - Activation of DICVS As Required

Of the 75 events sampled, 96% (72 events) met the standard for compliance. The remaining three events not meeting the standard for compliance occurred in Central Area. The Department policy regarding DICVS activation is a recurring topic of roll call discussion, and a standardized training schedule and confirmation of receipt of training has been established to ensure all employees within OCB DICVS equipped commands have that training provided and documented. I have established a dedicated DICVS Inspection Unit for verifying Department policy compliance, and their efforts have identified continued improvements in policy compliance and performance, as well as provision of training.

Objective No. 3 - Video Completeness

Of the 72 events sampled, 99% (71 events) met the standard for compliance. The singular event not meeting the standard for compliance occurred in Newton Area. The event depicted premature deactivation of the DICVS, prior to an arrestee being removed from the rear seat of a police vehicle. Again, DICVS utilization and policy remain topics of focus in each command during roll call, and the Department policy requirements for

appropriateness of activation/deactivation are of primary inspection focus by my DICVS Inspection Unit.

This audit further identified two additional areas of concern, documented under "*Other Related Matters*" (pages 5 through 10). Those concerns and the remediation strategies I have since implemented to mitigate those deficiencies are as follow:

Employee's Documentation of DICVS Condition (page 6)

This audit determined that in 18 of the sampled 43 CAD Summary Reports submitted by personnel operating DICVS equipped vehicles, no apparent documentation existed verifying the operability or condition of the DICVS at start of watch. While prior protocols had been established within Operations-South Bureau (OSB) regarding DICVS equipment check documentation, at the time of this audit, those protocols had not yet been adopted nor required by OCB. While a suggestion had been made in the interest of best practices to document inspection results, the requirement to document inspection results via CAD Summary Report entry had not been established until after this audit had been completed. Currently, that documentation requirement has been established within OCB, and is a key point for routine inspection by my OCB DICVS Inspection Unit.

Physical Inspection of Cradle Port Antennas (page 7)

At the time of the physical inspections associated with this audit it was determined that of the 143 vehicles inspected, 10 displayed evidence of missing (1 vehicle), broken or damaged (9 vehicles) cradle port antennas. Appropriate administrative actions (personnel complaints) were immediately taken at the time of notification, and replacement of all antennas with any visible evidence of defect was made. Furthermore, I immediately implemented a multi-layer inspection process of cradle port antennas ensuring DICVS equipped vehicle deployment was with damage-free cradle port antennas. The inspection protocols include documentation of results via CAD Summary Report entry by officers deploying DICVS equipped vehicles at their start of watch, as well as inspection and documentation of the condition of every DICVS equipped vehicle by a supervisor at least once every Deployment Period, to include supervisor name and serial number, Shop Number, date, time, and condition/operability of equipment.

While additional concerns were noted regarding instances of degraded signal quality and transmission connectivity, those concerns appeared to fall under the purview of Tactical Technology Section, Information Technology Bureau, and were submitted therein for consideration.

If you have any questions regarding this correspondence, please contact Lieutenant II McNeill Gardner, Adjutant, OCB, at (213) 833-3735.



ROBERT N. ARCOS, Deputy Chief
Commanding Officer
Operations-Central Bureau